

ACTIVITY: PHOTOVOICES

Photovoice methodology was developed in 1995 by Caroline C. Wang and her colleagues as a means for women living in rural villages in China to communicate important health messages to policy-makers. It's founded in a history of photographic approaches to auto-ethnography and activism. The KLCC II National Evaluation Team used the photovoice methodology as a process for participants to better understand how they came to define the overall concept of their initiatives and the promise and potential of their strategic designs. Even if your evaluation work is nowhere near the national scale, you can use the photovoice methodology to help your group members better understand collective leadership and how it affects their communities and to identify future strategies for community change.

OVERVIEW

This activity demonstrates a grassroots participatory methodology that puts cameras in the hands of community members. It charges these community members with the task of recording and reflecting on their community's strengths and concerns.

OBJECTIVES

- To recognize and honor the value of participants' subjective experience
- To "reflect the community back upon itself" and reveal social and political realities
- To facilitate critical and analytical discussion of social conditions and their root cause issues

TIME REQUIRED

Allow a minimum of 4 weeks to disseminate cameras and information, take and develop photos, write narrative descriptions, and reflect on the experience. The process culminates with a full-day (8-hour) group workshop.

ADVANCE PREPARATION

All participants will need to sign a consent form (**Handout 7D**). For the orientation and photo-taking stages, you'll need to determine three framing questions (see **Pre-Process: Developing Framing Questions** on the following page).

SUPPLIES

You'll need disposable cameras, self-addressed postage-paid express envelopes, and copies of the invitation, consent form, photo release form, Photovoice Ethics and photo reflection sheet (**Handout 7C, Handout 7D, Handout 7E, Handout 7F** and **Handout 7G**, respectively) for each participant. Poster board and full-sheet labels (Avery 5165) are optional supplies, but we think they're the best materials for mounting and displaying participants' photos.

For the full-day workshop, you'll need materials to mount the photos: poster board, double-sided tape, etc. You'll also need pens, paper, and colored sticky dots (8–10 per participant) for participants. You might want to consider arranging video and audio recorders to document the workshop.

Orientation and Photo-Taking

WHAT	TIME	HOW	MATERIALS
Pre-Process: Developing framing questions	30 min	<p>Framing questions serve as guidelines for participants in identifying photo subjects that are meaningful for them and address the goals of the project. Provide three concise questions that are targeted to the goals of your organization yet broad enough to allow room for participants to explore, share their unique voice, and tell what they think needs to be known.</p> <p>Here are the framing questions KLCC II used in its photovoice process:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. What activities best show collective leadership in action to improve teaching and learning in your community? 2. In what ways did KLCC help your community cross boundaries (of race, class, ethnicity, age, gender, etc.)? 3. What changes (such as new partnerships, pathways, policies, practices, etc.) brought about through KLCC do you think may endure? 	
Step 1: Orientation meeting	1–2 hours	<p>Host an orientation meeting with the participants. At this meeting, review the purpose of the photovoice process and orient them to the framing questions and the calendar of deadlines. Give each participant the following materials:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ A disposable camera labeled with his or her name; ■ A hard copy of the framing questions; ■ Photo release forms and Handout 7E and Handout 7F (“Photo Release Form and Photovoice Ethics”); and ■ Return postage-paid envelopes (express/FedEx return envelopes). 	<p>Handouts with framing questions and deadline calendar</p> <p>Disposable cameras labeled with participants’ names</p> <p>Copies of Handout 7E</p> <p>Copies of Handout 7F</p> <p>Self-addressed, postage-paid envelopes</p>
Step 2: Photo-taking, collection, development, and reflection	About 2 weeks	<p>Allow participants a 2-week timeline to take their pictures and return their cameras and the subject release forms (in the self-addressed, postage-paid envelopes you provided). About midway through that time period, remind them of their deadline by phone or email.</p> <p>When you’ve received the cameras, develop the film. Process one digital/CD copy and two standard-sized prints of each photo. Label both sets of photos on the back (e.g., #1–#XX). Keep the CD and one set of photos; mail the second set of photos back to the participants. Include photo reflection sheets (Handout 7G), directions for the next steps in the process, and another self-addressed, postage-paid envelope.</p>	<p>Handout with directions for next steps</p> <p>Copies of Handout 7G (Photo Reflection Sheet)</p> <p>Self-addressed, postage-paid express envelopes</p> <p>Full-sheet labels</p> <p>Poster board</p>

continued next page

WHAT	TIME	HOW	MATERIALS
<p>Step 2: Photo-taking, collection, development, and reflection (cont.)</p>		<p>In the directions, instruct participants to select six photos that best respond to the initial framing questions and that they're willing to share. Participants should select photos they find most significant and meaningful – those photos they'd want to share with a broader audience because of the story the photo tells or the way it reflects the framing questions. For each photo selected, the participant will complete a reflection sheet describing and providing a rationale for the selection (Handout 7G). Participants return ALL their photos and the reflection sheets in the self-addressed, postage-paid envelope.</p> <p>After you receive these photos and reflection sheets, process one set of the six photos in a 5"x7" size and two sets in an 8"x10" size. Type up the descriptions from the reflection sheets and print them onto white, full-sheet labels (we like Avery 5165).</p> <p>Mount the prints and reflections onto poster board in a uniform manner that doesn't distract from the photos and the accompanying descriptions.</p>	

Photovoice Workshop

Organize a full-day workshop for participants to come together and learn collectively from the photovoice experience. There are five parts to this portion of the process:

- Pure appreciation of one another's' photos;
- Small-group work to tell a collective story;
- Sharing of story and photo montage;
- Sticky dot process; and
- Full-group discussion to develop a collective story.

Remember to provide lunch and refreshments, as well as free time for participants to interact.

WHAT	TIME	HOW	MATERIALS
<p>Step 1: Pure appreciation</p>	30 min	<p>As participants arrive at the workshop, encourage them to circulate through the room to view and appreciate the photos and reflections and to talk with other participants about the experience of taking and selecting photos. During this time, evaluators circulate through the room. Evaluators ask participants clarifying and probing questions and take notes, and possibly audio and video recordings of the responses (see Potential Probes for Individual Photo Montages).</p>	<p>Poster board with photos and descriptions, mounted on the wall</p> <p>Video and audio recorders, if desired</p>

continued next page

WHAT	TIME	HOW	MATERIALS
Step 2: Small-group work	1 hour 15 min	<p>Divide the full group into smaller groups that have some commonalities – the location of the community they come from, themes of the photos, or some other thread that could link the group. (The size of your small groups will vary according to the total number of participants; we like five to six people per group.)</p> <p>Small-group members work together to select six photos from their individual photo boards that best respond to the framing questions. Each group then uses those six photos to create a team photo board with a title and a 15-minute oral presentation of its photo board.</p>	<p>Poster board</p> <p>Double-sided tape</p>
Step 3: Small-group stories	15 min for each small group	<p>Give each small group 15 minutes to present to the full group the theme of and the photos on its photo board. Use the “Clarifying Questions” and “Probing Questions” from Potential Probes for Small-Group Teamwork Montages to engage the group in a discussion of its selections. Ask that the audience not engage in Q&A during this process but jot down their clarifying questions, their “ah-ha!” moments, and their own stories to share later in the day.</p>	<p>Pens or pencils</p> <p>Paper</p>
Step 4: Sticky dot process	30 min	<p>Give each participant a certain number of different colored sticky dots (8–10). Each color should correspond to a specific theme or category (i.e., a framing question). Give the participants time to place the dots next to the pictures they feel speak best to the overall theme and purpose of the group’s work.</p> <p>During a break, count the dots and group the most popular photos in each category into a first-round gallery layout. Depending on your goal for the photovoice process, you may select the most popular photos in each theme area or select the 8–10 photos that received the most dots. Once you’ve counted the dots and selected the photos, display the duplicates of those photos to begin the first round of the gallery layout.</p>	<p>Colored sticky dots</p> <p>Poster board for display of selected photos</p>
Step 5: Group discussion and gallery design	2 hours	<p>Present the results – the first-round gallery layout – of the sticky-dot process to the group. Ask for any thoughts, reactions, or questions (use the questions from Potential Probes for Full-Group Discussion and Montage). This is the time for participants to share their individual and collective experiences as they relate to specific photos, name the underlying issues and themes, and revise and reinvent the groupings.</p>	

continued next page

WHAT	TIME	HOW	MATERIALS
Step 5: Group discussion and gallery design (cont.)		<p>Ideally, through the course of the discussion, the thematic grouping will take on more community relevance and your role as a facilitator will become less and less important; participants will themselves own the discussion and the thematic analysis. By the end of the discussion, guide your group to design its photo gallery that will be shared with the larger community.</p> <p>Close the discussion and the workshop with some brief discussion questions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ What did you learn about yourself, this group (organization), and the community? ■ What are our next steps? 	

Make sure your participants' great work has a chance to be appreciated by the community at large. Follow through on your group's plans for a gallery and make the necessary arrangements (time, space, food, parking, childcare, etc.) for the community to gather and view the gallery. This is the participants' time to share the work of the group with their community and identified policy-makers and to engage these people in conversation about the identified themes.

For more information about photovoice, check out the photovoice website:

<http://www.photovoice.com/index.html>.

POTENTIAL PROBES FOR INDIVIDUAL PHOTO MONTAGES

Clarifying Questions

1. Please tell me more about what's going on in this picture [may want to point out a particular activity or relationship in the photo].
2. Please tell me more about the people in this picture. Why did you want to focus on them?
3. Tell me more about why you took this picture.

Probing Questions

1. How does this picture (or photo montage) reveal collective leadership? What other leadership activities were you engaged in that you did not present in a photo?
2. I see that this picture highlights a group meeting. How, in light of the photo and your experiences working with this group, do you believe both individual and collective leadership was learned in your group?
3. I see that in this photo, you highlight [insert activity]. Tell me more about this activity and how it [insert: created individual leadership skills, collective leadership capacity; bridged differences; created new pathways for community participation, community change, new policies and practices, etc.].
4. What particular partnerships were forged here? Can you explain what's new about this partnership?
5. If you had taken a similar picture of these people/this activity, say, 5 years before, would the picture show something different?
6. I see that this picture shows [insert place]. Please tell me more about this place and why it's important to your group's work (probe for economic, political, cultural context, tensions and concrete group activities that addressed these).
7. What does this photo **not** show? In light of your photo composition, what impact do you believe that you, as a member of this group, have made on your community? What impact has the collective group made? (Encourage the participants to draw on the photo as they present their response. Probe in the area of finance, culture and language, school-family-community partnerships, education, etc.)
8. How is your photo composition different from and similar to the others in this cluster?

POTENTIAL PROBES FOR SMALL-GROUP TEAMWORK MONTAGES

Clarifying Questions

1. Please explain to me why your team selected these six photos.
2. Can you tell me more about how these six pictures work together – that is, what story do you intend to tell?

Probing Questions

1. As you look over all these pictures, how are they similar and how are they different? What different stories are the pictures telling? What stories are they not telling?
2. Why did you or your team select this as one of your six key photos?
3. How does the composition illuminate the collective leadership for community change around the theme of [insert theme from probing questions]?
4. I see that in the photo your team selected, you're highlighting [insert activity/activities here]. Tell me more and, in particular, how the photo speaks to [insert: individual leadership skills, collective leadership capacity, bridging differences, creating new pathways for community participation, community change, new policies and practices, etc.].
5. What activities in these photos do you believe will endure in your community?
6. How have the activities you highlight in your story affected other community activities?
7. If the sky were the limit, what would be your next steps to further the work of your group in your community? What might hinder this way forward?

POTENTIAL PROBES FOR FULL-GROUP DISCUSSION AND MONTAGE

1. How does this picture (or cluster of pictures) tell the viewer what collective leadership is and the impact it has on [insert theme: improving teaching and learning, building effective youth-adult partnerships, etc.]?
2. How does this picture (or cluster of pictures) show differences (of race, class, ethnicity, gender, etc.) within a community and how these differences can be bridged?
3. What challenges are being highlighted here? How are they being addressed successfully or unsuccessfully?
4. As you build and reflect on this collective montage, how does it speak to creating systemic changes in a community? To what end?
5. How does this story reveal elements of replication, adaptation, and growth of your group within and across communities?

HANDOUT 7C: INVITATION TO JOIN THE PHOTOVOICE PROCESS

Please fill in the blank parts with the appropriate information. Have your participants keep the invitation letter for their records. Collect the consent forms and keep them for your records.

Please keep this consent form for your records!

This consent form acknowledges your participation in the _____ [name of your organization] photovoice process. The activities will be administered by _____ [name of facilitating team], which consists of _____ [list names of co-facilitators].

The photovoice process will ask that you spend 1 week taking one roll of film (27 exposures) and then mail or deliver the camera back to us (self-addressed, postage-paid envelope provided). We will develop your photos and return them to you. We will then ask you to select and reflect in writing on six of your pictures that you believe are most meaningful in their description of the work of the fellowship and that you would want to share with a broader audience. You will return the photos and reflections to us (self-addressed, postage-paid envelope provided). You will then participate in a 1-day learning workshop that will engage you and other participants in the photovoice process through a facilitated discussion and analysis.

During this full-day session, we may be audiotaping and video recording the conversations and taking field notes. At any time, you can request that the recorders be turned off. You also have the right not to answer any questions you choose. The recordings and transcripts will be kept in a locked file cabinet, and your identity (if you choose not to be identified by name) will not be disclosed (we will use "site participant"). The data will be used in a report to _____ [insert name] about the project, and may be used in published articles and presentations.

Because of the small number of participants (9–15), identity might be discerned; therefore, only limited confidentiality can be guaranteed. However, your privacy will be protected to the maximum extent allowable by law. Please know that participation in this project is voluntary and that you may choose at any time not to participate. This withdrawal would not incur any penalty or loss of benefits to you or your program.

Should you have any questions or concerns about the rights of subjects and the duties of investigators, or are dissatisfied at any time with any aspect of the study, you may contact – anonymously, if you wish – _____ [insert contact person].

Should you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact _____ [name of lead facilitator and contact information].

Sincerely,

HANDOUT 7D: CONSENT FORM

PLEASE RETURN THIS SHEET!

The facilitators have my permission to focus observations on my interactions with other participants during the photovoice process.

Yes No

The facilitators have my permission to access the photos, photo reflections, and other documents I develop as part of the reporting process.

Yes No

The facilitators have my permission to use audiotape and video recording equipment for group and individual conversations during the photovoice process.

Yes No

The facilitators have my permission to use audiotapes, video recorders, and photographs that may include me in presentations, as long as they do not identify me by name or through other background information without my consent.

Yes No

Your signature below indicates your voluntary agreement to participate in this evaluation.

Participant's name (PLEASE PRINT): _____

Email address: _____

Phone number: _____

Participant's Signature

Date

Parent or Guardian Signature
(if participant is under 18)

Date

HANDOUT 7E: PHOTO RELEASE FORM

Return Release to: [Name of organization] _____
 [Address] _____

 [Phone] _____
 [Fax] _____
 [Email] _____

I give to _____ [name of organization], its nominees, partners, and assigns, unlimited permission to copyright and use photographs that may include me in presentations, as long as they do not identify me by name or through other background information. I hereby waive any right that I (and Minor) may have to inspect or approve the copy and/or finished product or products that may be used in connection therewith or the use to which it may be applied.

Name of person photographed (please print): _____
 Age (if under 18): _____
 Street address, city, state, and zip code:

 Signature: _____ Date: _____

Consent of parent or legal guardian if above individual is a minor

I consent and agree, individually and, as parent or legal guardian of the minor named above, to the foregoing terms and provisions. I hereby warrant that I am of full age and have every right to contract for the minor in the above regard. I state further that I have read the above information release and that I am fully familiar with the contents.

Signature: _____ Relationship: _____

Photographer name: _____
 Signature: _____
 Assignment/Date: _____
 Location: _____

HANDOUT 7F: PHOTOVOICE ETHICS: SAFETY, IMPACT, AND OBLIGATION

Photovoice is, by design, intended to include participants in participatory inquiry. They become documentary photographers at their site; their objective is to take pictures of activities, events, symbols, and people (photo subjects) that best respond to the framing (trigger) questions. The impact of this work can extend to include:

- The photovoice photographers,
- The photo subjects, and
- The broader community that experiences the stories and photos through the Community Gallery.

Although safety and ethical considerations will vary across situations and rarely lend themselves to standard solutions, we can benefit from consideration of the following issues and questions.

Safety

Photovoice participants are asked to photograph the work of their community. They may document elements of strength and issues of concern. Recording these elements for public dissemination could have negative repercussions for the participant – as the photo is being taken or after the photo and explanation of it have been disseminated. Here are some concerns and what we will instruct photovoice participants to do in practice.

KEY CONCERNS	YOUR PRACTICE
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Potential risks to photovoice photographers from putting themselves in dangerous settings or situations. ■ Potential risks to photovoice photographers from photo subjects. ■ Potential risks to photovoice photographers from being identified in connection with their photos and stories. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Give careful thought to the context and content of your photos – the communities in which you live, the issues you will be exploring, and the situations you might get into while documenting your work. ■ Because you know your neighborhoods better than we do, we encourage you to use your street sense. ■ “Shooting smart” – maintaining your personal safety – is of highest priority. No photo is worth personal danger. ■ Remember that there are alternative ways to present issues (e.g., through abstract representation). ■ Take your photos in public spaces (from which participants can photograph without being seen as trespassing) versus private property.

Subjects of Photographs

The evaluation team and the photovoice participants have an ethical responsibility to their photo subjects. We want to emphasize that photovoice photographs are meant for dissemination. For this reason, there is no point in taking photos that cannot be shown for lack of the subject's permission through the release form. Here is our key concern and what we instruct photovoice participants to do in practice.

KEY CONCERNS	YOUR PRACTICE
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Potential risks to photo subjects from being identified in connection with particular situations or activities in photos. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ As a documentary photographer, you must respect the privacy of others. If someone does not want his or her picture taken, don't take it. ■ It is essential that photo subjects sign a release form to be photographed. We have included forms. For children or youth under the age of 18, you will need approval from a parent or guardian. This is provided for on the release form. Please make more copies if you need them. ■ Please emphasize to photo subjects that the photographs are meant for dissemination. Photos cannot be shown without a subject's release. ■ Again, there are ways to portray issues of concern that don't require showing individuals.

Impact on Your Community

KEY CONCERNS	YOUR PRACTICE
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Potential risks to your community as a whole through generating conflict around issues or negative image. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Because of your background using a number of dissemination tools, we are confident that you understand the importance of weighing potential for collective good against potential for both individual and collective harm.

Obligation of the Evaluation Team

KEY CONCERNS	YOUR PRACTICE
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ The photovoice process puts the evaluation team in a close partnership with site participants. The effectiveness of our work is based on bonds of trust and our commitment that participant stories and voices be meaningful. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Because of your background using a number of dissemination tools, we are confident that you understand the importance of weighing potential for collective good against potential for both individual and collective harm.

continued next page

KEY CONCERNS	YOUR PRACTICE
<ul style="list-style-type: none">■ At the same time, we know that you are invested in the photovoice process and data. Because of the many potential uses for these data, we will share stories in a variety of ways for a variety of purposes.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">■ We will strive to build a participatory component through ongoing phases of analysis.■ You will be a part of the decision-making process in how the photos and stories will be disseminated.■ We will strive to balance agendas through finding “both/and” solutions and multiple avenues for dissemination that meet the needs of various stakeholders.

HANDOUT 7G: PHOTO REFLECTION SHEET

Participant code number:	Photo #:
	Date:
	Site location #:
Brief description of photo:	
Why do you want to share this photo?	
What's the real story this photo tells?	
How does this relate to your life, the lives of people in your community, or both?	



Handout 7G

“The Most Significant Change” and the photovoice activities were just two of many exercises employed to facilitate the KLCC II evaluation process. For results of the evaluation to date, visit www.klccleadership.org. For a more complete treatment of evaluation – including how to engage youth and adults as partners in evaluation and how to fully develop and implement an evaluation plan – see our **Reflect and Improve** tool kit in the “Activities, Tool Kits & Reports” section of our website, www.theinnovationcenter.org.